

No. U-11018/02/2017-HR (Vol.III)
Government of India
Ministry of Health and Family Welfare
(Department of Health Research)

Minutes of the third meeting of the 'Inter-Departmental Committee for identifying viable new systems of medicine / therapy', held at the Department of Health Research, New Delhi, on 09.01.2018 at 10.00 AM, to consider proposals seeking recognition of Electrohomoeopathy as a system of medicine.

List of participants from the organisations, seeking recognition of 'Electrohomoeopathy' as a system of medicine, is placed at **Annexure**.

2. In his introductory remarks, Dr. V.M. Katoch, Chairperson, IDC, observed that Electrohomoeopathy was claimed to be an old system of healthcare in India, and, according to its proponents, this system had a history of 150 years and, as per some submissions, has existed in India for nearly 100 years. He stated that he has gone through the proposals (including voluminous attachments) received from the organizations seeking recognition for Electrohomoeopathy as a system of medicine, and noted that while most of the points were common, however, relevant reference literature was mostly missing and inadequate. He stated that list of authentic scientific books, literature and journals, like those in Allopathy, Ayurveda, etc., was a must and needed to be presented, by a joint body of all the applicants. He emphasized that IDC required nothing but pure scientific data and information in order to evaluate the viability and efficacy of the proposed system. He hoped that in the presentations to follow, the applicants would endeavour to provide this information.

3. Dr. Darshan Shankar, Vice-Chancellor, TransDisciplinary University, Bengaluru, who is a member of IDC, could not attend the meeting owing to prior commitment. However, he has e-mailed his views, after going through the proposals, which were circulated to him. He has conveyed that "*Electropathy / Electrohomoeopathy should be examined as a mode of therapy and not as a system of medicine*".

4. Thereafter, the following organizations made detailed power-point-presentations, one by one, before the IDC on their respective proposals for recognition of 'Electrohomoeopathy' as a system of medicine, with KERF and SEPA doing it jointly:

- (i) Electrohomeopathic Research and Development Organisation of India (ERDOI), Delhi.
- (ii) Central Council of Electro Homeopathic System of Medicine (CCEHSM), West Bengal.

- (iii) Maharashtra Electro Homeopathic Chikitsak Association (MEHCA), Maharashtra.
- (iv) Kasturba Electropathic Research Foundation (KERF), Odisha.
- (v) State Electro Homoeopathic Physician's Association (SEPA), Odisha.
- (vi) Indian Electrohomoeopathy Recognition Sangharsh Committee (IEHRSC), Gujarat.
- (vii) N.E.H.M. of India, Delhi.

5. All these bodies made detailed 'presentations', giving their own justifications for recognising this system. Some such submissions were as under :

- Electrohomoeopathy has its own principle, which logically explains concept of health, disease and therapeutics .
- The system has its own way of diagnosis to ascertain the root cause of sickness.
- The system has medicines for internal and external applications to manage the diagnosed sickness as per its law of dosology.
- The system has its own unique "Spagyric based Pharmacy" to prepare the drugs, which is already a part of " German Homoeopathic Pharmacopeia".
- Diagnostic and therapeutic system is safe from human health point of view.
- Broad-based clinical data is available to ascertain therapeutic value of the system, which is recognized by various research papers, pre-clinical studies.
- It is entirely different - in theory, practice and art of healing - from other recognised systems of medicine, like Allopathy, Ayurveda, Naturopathy, Unani and Siddha, and has no interrelation by any means. Neither it has any resemblance, in the art of treatment, with some other popular therapies like Acupuncture, Acupressure, Reflexology, where the points on body are pierced and pressed to tonify the "Chi". But, in Electrohomoeopathy, some special points are identified on the body for application of medicines (*for external application*) to get the result.
- This is a natural and most scientific system of medical science based on the law of nature that can preserve and cure nature's creation. It enables restoration of health of the living beings quickly, gently and permanently.
- In 1865, Dr. Count Cesare Mattei invented this quick healing medical science and titled it as "Electro-Homeopathy", as he observed its magical ultra-fast electric current pulse like remedial effectiveness and compared it with the instantaneous electrical induction phenomenon occurred in a Lyden Jar. The medicines are natural, harmless, simple, unique, non-toxic, non-alcoholic and have no side effect. Besides, it is rather cheap and affordable to all sections of the society.
- The electrohomeopathy medicines are prepared by scientific process called 'Cohobation', which was introduced by Dr. Theophrastus Von Hoheneim, in which the living energies of the plants in the form of 'Spagyric Essences' obtained from selected parts of medicinal plants. These remedies have maximum curative capacity to regulate the Lymph and Blood, and also to keep them purified maintaining 'Homeostasis'.

- Electrohomoeopathic drugs are non- poisonous, and do not create drug diseases or leave any bad effects.
- They act with remarkable rapidity.
- Medicines mainly work on the blood and lymph.
- They furnish useful elements to the plasma of the blood and they provide nutrition for the cells of which the tissues are built.
- They give tone to the brain and nerves by which the bodily processes are controlled, and strengthen the organs of digestion.
- They promote the expulsion, through the skin and channels, of morbid and superfluous substances which interfere with the health of the body.
- They give to the blood and lymph, and more particularly to the leucocytes, which are found in those fluids, such additional vigorous and vitality as enables them more successfully to attack, weaken, neutralize, destroy and expel the bacilli and other disease producing germs which invade the organism.
- They embody the active principle of a large variety of plants, including some of the subtler elements which have played a prominent part in the activities of vegetable life, and which Count Mattei described as 'Electricity', while others have called them 'Electalins' or Electrals.
- They are, with the exception of recently introduced laxative remedy, and of the liquid electricities, quite tasteless. Consequently they are very readily taken by infants and children.
- It is easily affordable to all classes of people of the society.
- The remedies do not require any preservatives.
- There are 114 medicinal plants used to prepare remedies .
- There are total 38 medicines divided in 9 groups of remedies.
- The selection of remedies depend on TEMPERAMENT.
- The selection of Diluted or Undiluted doses depend upon the condition of disease.
- EH medicines are applicable in the form of pills, dilutions, ointments, oils, injectables, eye/ear drops, compresses and baths.
- Electrohomoeopathy medicines are manufactured under standardized preparations, the methods being controlled as per the German Homeopathic Pharmacopoeia (GHP). Electrohomoeopathic medicines are prepared in the form of Spagyric Medicines. These natural remedies are made in licensed laboratories in Germany and Switzerland with the same standards of safety as modern drugs. They are produced in such a way that no alkaloids or toxic molecules can be found in the final products.
- There are about ten or more boards imparting education on Electrohomoeopathy via hundreds of institutions in India. Apart from this, there are a number of bodies in the

country involved in research works - educational, pharmacological, pharmaceutical and clinical.

- Future B.E.M.S. Course Plan :

1st Year	2 nd Year	3rd Year	4th Year	5th Year
Materia Medica I Anatomy-I Physiology & Bio-chemistry-I Pharmacy	Anatomy –II Physiology & Bio-chemistry-II Pathology-I P.S.M & F.S.M Philosophy	Gynecology Practice of Medicine-I Pathology-II E.N.T Ophthalmology	Practice of Medicine-II Materia Medica II Surgery Paed. & Obst	Internship

- Similarity with other systems of medicine :

	Homoeopathy	Ayurveda	Electrohomeopathy
Anatomy	Yes	Yes	Yes
Physiology	Yes	Yes	Yes
Pathology	Yes	Yes	Yes
Practice of Medicine	Yes Nature's law of SIMILIA, SIMILIBUS , CURENTUR	Yes	Yes Maintaining COMPLEXA COMPLEXIS CURENTUR
Pharmacology	Yes	Yes	Yes
	Single Medicine chosen out of large number of medicine	Multiple Mixture of Complex Medicine	Multiple Medicines out of only 60 numbers of medicines mentioned in EH Materia Medica

	mentioned in Materia Medica		
Therapy & Medical Management	Yes	Yes	Yes

- One presentation also mentioned that Electrohomeopathic organizations have since succeeded to arrange some original and valuable literature and other authentic information to prove the efficiency of the system, which was mostly found incomplete by the expert committees organized by the Government, from time to time, to evaluate the facts of the alternative medical sciences, especially the Electrohomeopathy, for their official recognition.

6. During the 'presentations', Dr. V.M. Katoch, Chairperson, Dr. Bhushan Patwardhan, Professor & Director, Interdisciplinary School of Health Sciences, Savitribai Phule Pune University, Pune, Dr. Y.K. Gupta, Professor & Head, Department of Pharmacology, AIIMS, New Delhi and Dr. K.K. Talwar, Chairman-Cardiology, Max Super Speciality Hospital, New Delhi, emphasised, inter alia, that scientific books, which are authentic, are required for evaluation of the Electrohomoeopathy system. Dr. B.D. Athani, Spl. DG, Directorate General of Health Services, raised a query as to what were the number of drugs in this system, where and how these are manufactured, and how they are labelled. He added that the number of combinations, where these are manufactured and what is the system for quality control are also required. He further stated that a common table is required in this regard from all the applicants.

7. Dr. K.K. Talwar requested MEHCA, during latter's presentation, to provide curriculum, course content and qualifications required to get admission in Electrohomoeopathy courses. The Chairperson advised all the participating organisations to provide a common comparison table, showing curriculum, courses, etc., for degree / diploma. He made it clear that the committee is not to see the legality aspect, but only pure science to see that it is safe or not for the public. Shri V.K. Gauba, Joint Secretary (DHR), observed that the existing bodies, having maximum connect with any new system seeking recognition, need to be utilized for recognition / monitoring such system rather than creating new bodies. On this principle - he added - if the Electrohomoeopathy system is ultimately found to be viable, either as a full-fledged system or a therapy, then it may have to be suitably aligned with the AYUSH dispensation, to which systems like Electrohomoeopathy appear to be very close. Chairperson, Dr. Talwar and Dr. Patwardhan unanimously demanded standardised scientific papers and course curriculum. Dr. Talwar further enquired whether it is a part of homoeopathy in Germany, because it has been stated that Electrohomoeopathy medicines are manufactured under standardized preparation, the methods

being controlled are as per the German Homeopathic Pharmacopoeia. The applicant replied that it is not a part of homoeopathy. Dr. Talwar further asked if they were convinced that it was not a part of homoeopathy. There was no satisfactory answer. At this point, Dr. Manoj Nesari, Adviser, Ministry of AYUSH, commented that the word 'homoeopathy' in the term 'Electrohomoeopathy' is a misnomer, and that homoeopathy has nothing to do with it. Dr. Bahubali Shah, ERDO, New Delhi - stated to be a homoeopath himself - mentioned that EH is different from homoeopathy. Dr. Katoch commented that homoeopathic drugs are made from organic, inorganic and poisonous substances / plants, unlike the drugs under Electrohomoeopathy. After detailed deliberations, some expert members were not very convinced with the submissions that it was completely different from Homoeopathy, particularly when the method for preparation of drugs in the system was stated to owe its origin to the German Homoeopathic Pharmacopoeia.

8. Dr. V.M. Katoch, Chairperson, observed that all the applicants must ensure that the system agrees on the 'five' principles (*essential criteria*), and then the 'two' desirable criteria. He stated that if it started from Italy, then there must be text books in Italy and also in Germany. Further, he wanted the names of institutions in these countries where Electrohomoeopathy was taught. He added that the committee requires a common list on all these issues. Dr. Nesari wanted to know whether in countries like Germany, UK, etc., Electrohomoeopathy medicines were regarded as drugs or products. Dr. Bhushan Patwardhan observed that this meeting being scientific in nature, the committee needs to see all these. Dr. Patwardhan further commented that while in the country there were no dearth of so-called journals, which could be easily printed and procured on demand by spending money, but what was required was genuine standardized books and scientific literature (papers published in scientific journals, etc) on the subject. Dr. Y.K. Gupta wanted to know about the type of drugs, who prepared them and sold in the country.

9. On certain submissions made by the representatives of KERF and SEPA during their joint presentation, Dr. Y.K. Gupta asked that a statement, indicating names of all text books, with dates of edition, new editions, etc., should be jointly prepared, and submitted to the committee. He advised that it should be collected from all parts of the country and abroad. Chairperson observed that all the 29 invitee organizations should do this collectively, and then provide to the committee. Dr. Patwardhan stated that the top 10 publications should be listed. Dr. Gupta said there should be globally data-based index.

10. During IEHRSC presentation, Dr. Y.K. Gupta wanted to know as to what was the special thing about Electrohomoeopathy, which makes it different from other systems. Representative of IEHRSC observed that science is endless, and whenever necessity arises, development takes place, and whatever tools are made today, it would be for the next generation. Dr. Gupta further mentioned that the following information would be relevant :

- What is the 'science' of this system ?

- Human resource required to develop it.
- How many books are there ?
- How many qualified teachers are there to impart education ?
- What is to be done for conducting examinations ?
- Strength and weaknesses of the system

11. NEHM was the last to make presentation. Chairperson observed that in the year 1991, the then Deputy Minister in the Ministry of Health had authorised NEHM for development, promotion and research in Electropathy in India. He, therefore, wanted to know what developments on the subject were made during the last 26 years, and what coordination was done all these years. NEHM stated that the Electrohomoeopathy method was quicker, cheaper and safer. To a query from Dr. Y.K. Gupta if they are awarding 'degrees', NEHM informed that it is 'certificate' only (BEMS : Bachelor of Electrohomoeopathic Medicine and Surgery). Dr. Gupta commented that normally 'Bachelor' word is used to denote 'degree'. Chairperson stated that since Electrohomoeopathy has come from outside the country, committee requires authentic documents about the system. NEHM stated that in the first year, anatomy, physiology, pathology and pharmacy are taught, in the second year it is practical medicine, gyanocology, and in the third year, it is material medica and practice of medicine. Dr. Y.K. Gupta asked as to which council has taken out the pharmacopeia. NEHM replied that it is extract from German Pharmacopea. Dr. Gupta observed that it means that they don't have pharmacopeia. Dr. Talwar commented that German Pharmacopea was perhaps for homoeopathy only.

12. Though the committee appreciated the work done generally by the applicants, following were some of the inconsistencies which could be noticed during submissions made in the presentations :

- ✓ Lack of latest scientific, standardised and authentic literature in the form of journals, books, etc., published in the public domain.
- ✓ Details of the latest research work on the system.
- ✓ List of skilled persons / experts, imparting education on the system, institutes, and training facilities therein.
- ✓ While one of the applicants has stated that BEMS is a certificate course, some others have mentioned that it is degree course. Committee noted this varying statements, and observed that correct position should be intimated and that there must be uniformity in submission of important information by all the promoters.
- ✓ How the system could be called entirely different from Homoeopathy, when preparation of drugs under the system is somehow linked to the German Homoeopathic Pharmacopeia.

13. Dr. V.M. Katoch stated that the committee requires papers, reference to relevant books, recent books on all the aspects of management of diseases for which Electrohomeopathy is stated to be effective. He commented that as preparation follow Spygyric principles why nomenclature of system should not resemble that. He mentioned that the bodies advocating for 'Acupuncture' took six years to arrange for documents and hoped that all stakeholders for this system will do it faster. Dr. Patwardhan wanted list of top 10 books on Electrohomoeopathy. He also wanted to know if it has been separated from homoeopathy, and if so, then on what basis.

Conclusion

14. Concluding the detailed discussions held on the subject, Dr. V.M. Katoch, Chairperson, advised all the 29 applicant-organisations to hold meeting among themselves, based on the discussions held on the day, and then come back to the committee with authentic, standardised and purely scientific data / material, including books / journals / references, etc., on the system of Electrohomoeopathy, and with all other information and documents on all related issues, to facilitate proper evaluation of the viability of the system. He added that for the sake of proper and correct appraisal of the issue, all these applicants would be advised to make only one combined, consolidated and unanimous revised submission before the committee, and not individual submissions. And while doing this, they have to justify that the proposal satisfies seven principles / criteria laid down for recognition of a system which is defined in the notification of DHR. He made it clear that unless and until the committee was convinced about the suitability of the system for safe adoption in the healthcare mechanism, the committee would not be able to make any recommendations in its favour to the Government.

15. Lastly, Chairperson, IDC, expressed his appreciation about the immense hard work done, with a very positive and pro-active attitude, by the departmental team, headed by Shri V.K. Gauba, Joint Secretary, in organising this meet, and that he was proud of the Department, which he formerly had headed. Representatives of the applicant organisations too expressed their happiness and gratitude to the department for its initiative in organising this meet, and to involve them in the exercise.

16. This part of the meeting ended with a vote of thanks to the Chair and the Members.

Annexure

‘List of Participants’ from organisations, seeking recognition of ‘Electrohomoeopathy’ as a system of medicine, in the meeting of the ‘Inter-Departmental Committee for identifying viable new systems of medicine/ therapy’, held at the Department of Health Research, New Delhi, on 09.01.2018 at 10 AM.

Council of Electro Homoeopathic System of Medicine Research and Development Institute (CEHSMRDI), Andhra Pradesh.

1. Dr. K.A. Bakshi, Chairman
2. Shri Zainab N Bakshi

Vishnu Electrohomoeo Research Laboratory & J.S.V.S. Begusarai (VERL & JSVS), Bihar.

3. Dr. S.R. Pandit
4. Dr. Kapil Singh

Electrohomeopathic Research and Development Organisation of India (ERDOI), Delhi.

5. Dr.Ajit Singh, General Secretary
6. Dr.Bahubali Shah, Advisor

N.E.H.M. of India, Delhi.

7. Dr. A.P. Maurya, Expert
8. Dr. K.D. Tiwari, Expert

Electrohomeopathic Research Foundation (India) [ERF(I)], Delhi.

9. Ep. Rehanul Huda, President
10. Dr. Anju Tyagi

Indian Electro-Homoeopathy Recognition Sangharsh Committee (IEHRSC), Gujarat.

11. Dr.Susanta Padhee, Founder-Member
12. Dr. Kuldeep Singh, Founder-Member

Electrohomeopathic Research Forum (India) [ERF (I)], Himachal Pradesh.

- 13. Shri Sanjeev Sharma, Chairman
- 14. Dr. Surender Thakur, President

Madhya Pradesh Research & Development Organisation of Electro Homoeopathy (MPRDOEH), Madhya Pradesh.

- 15. Dr. Ajay Hardia, President
- 16. Dr. Amit Singh, Director

Bhartiya Alternative Practitioners Association of India (BAPAI), Madhya Pradesh.

- 17. Dr. K.K. Pathak

Maharashtra Electro Homeopathic Chikitsak Association (MEHCA), Maharashtra

- 18. Dr. Jamdade S.D., Counsellor
- 19. Dr. Kure P.K., Counsellor

Dr. Milind D. Potdar, Maharashtra.

- 20. Dr. Milind D. Potdar
- 21. Shri Sadashive Dhabe

Research Institute of Electrohomoeopathy Medical Science - RIEMS India (MEPA), Maharashtra

- 22. Shri Dharmendra Shah
- 23. Ms Priti Manchanda

State Electro Homoeopathic Physician's Association (SEPA), Odisha.

- 24. Dr. Kamalakanta Nayak, Technical Chairperson
- 25. Dr. Manoj Kumar Mahala, General Secretary

All Odisha Electro Homoeopathy Practitioner's Association (AOEHPA), Odisha.

- 26. Dr. Susanta Padhee, President
- 27. Dr. Lalatendu Dalai, Secretary

Kasturba Electropathic Research Foundation (KERF), Odisha.

- 28. Dr. Ajaya Kumar Pati, CEO
- 29. Dr. Saroj Kumar Sahu, Associate

Electro Homoeopathic Medicine Board (EHMB), Uttar Pradesh.

- 30. Dr. Hriday Narayan Lal, Secretary
- 31. Shri Ravi Shankar Singh, Asstt. Secretary

Eletrhomoeopathic & Alternative Medicine Board (EHAMB), Uttar Pradesh.

- 32. Dr. Ashok Kumar, Registrar
- 33. Dr. Sanjeev

Medical Board of Electro Homoeopathy System of Medicine (MBEHSM), Uttar Pradesh.

- 34. Prof (Dr.) R.P. Sharma, Chairman
- 35. Dr. Ibrahim

WEHO

- 36. Shri Devi Singh

Central Council of Electro Homeopathic System of Medicine, (CCEHSM), West Bengal.

- 37. Dr. A.K. Mallick, General Secretary
- 38. Dr. G.S. Taki, Member

Swapan Memorial Electrohomoeopathic Medical College & Hospital (SMEMCH), West Bengal.

- 39. Dr. Probhat Kumar Pal
- 40. Shri Prasanta Pal

All India Electrohomeo Medical Association (AIEMA), West Bengal.

- 41. Dr. G.S. Verma
- 42. Dr. Suresh Basu

General Council of Electrohomoeopathic System of Medicine (GCESM), West Bengal.

- 43. Shri C.D. Prabhakar Ji
- 44. Shri Satish Jagdale

Institute of Electro Homoeopathy of India (IEHI), West Bengal.

- 45. Dr. Kaiser Ahmed
- 46. Dr. Anand Sinha
